

ITTO PD 521/08 Rev. 3 (I)
Participatory Forest Management for Sustainable Utilization of Non-Timber Forest
Products Surrounding the Protected Area of Rinjani and Mutis Mountains, Nusa
Tenggara Province, Indonesia

Ex-Post Evaluation Report
Dr. Florence Pascua-Soriano

28 August 2015

Table of Contents

- Part 1 Executive Summary 1**
 - 1. Introduction 1**
 - 2. Evaluation scope, focus and approach..... 1**
 - 3. Project facts 1**
 - 4. Findings and lessons learned..... 2**
 - 4.1 Project Achievements2
 - 4.2 Project Formulation and Implementation.....2
 - 4.3 Lessons Learned.....3
 - 5. Conclusions and Recommendations..... 4**
 - 5.1 Conclusions4
 - 5.2 Recommendations.....4
- Part 2 Main Text 5**
 - 1. Introduction 5**
 - 1.1 Background and rationale of the evaluation5
 - 1.2 Project identification.....5
 - 1.3 Executing Agency and Collaborating Agencies.....5
 - 1.4 ITTO context of the project.....5
 - 2. Evaluation scope, focus and approach..... 6**
 - 2.1 Purpose6
 - 2.2 Terms of reference6
 - 2.3 Approach7
 - 3. Project facts 7**
 - 3.1 Background and origin7
 - 3.2 Development objective.....8
 - 3.3 Problem addressed8
 - 3.4 Specific objectives and outputs.....8
 - 3.5 Rationale.....8
 - 3.6 Start date and project duration.....8
 - 3.7 ITTO Contribution8
 - 4. Findings and lessons learned..... 9**
 - 4.1 Project Achievements9
 - 4.2 Project formulation and implementation.....12
 - 4.3 Lessons Learned.....13
 - 5. Conclusions and recommendations 14**
 - 5.1 Conclusions14
 - 5.2 Recommendations.....14
- Appendix A ITTO - Consultant agreed timelines 15**
- Appendix B Schedule of ex-post evaluation field activities in Indonesia 16**
- Appendix C List of evaluation participants 17**
- Appendix D Contents of the Elaborated Management Plan for Sustainable Utilization of Non-Timber Forest Products..... 20**
- Management Response..... 21**

Part 1 Executive Summary

1. Introduction

The Committee on Economics, Statistics and Markets and the Committee on Forest Industry (CEM-CFI), during their Forty-Eighth Session in November 2014 decided that an ex-post evaluation of ITTO PD 521/08 Rev. 3 (I) be conducted to establish how well the project served its purpose and draw recommendations for future action.

The ex-post evaluation was carried out on 4-11 May 2013 or approximately twenty-two months after project completion.

This report provides an in-depth diagnosis of the project, identifying its successful and unsuccessful outcomes, the reasons for the successes and failures, the sustainability of the project's outcomes, and contribution towards the achievement of ITTA 2006 Objectives and ITTO Strategic Action Plan 2008-2011, and to draw lessons that can be used to improve similar projects in the future.

2. Evaluation scope, focus and approach

The evaluation commenced with a review of the project design, logical framework matrix, planned vs. reported outputs, and intended outcomes based on the project document, progress reports, technical reports, the completion report and other associated documents provided by ITTO for this evaluation. Guide questions for key project staff and selected participants were formulated.

The Project Coordinator, the Directorate General of Watershed and Social Forestry (EA) representative, and Ministry of Forestry staff were briefed on the purpose and methodology of the ex-post evaluation during the opening meeting held in Jakarta on 4 May 2015.

From 5-9 May 2015, on the spot evaluation, interviews and meetings were held with project field staff, participating community leaders and farmers, and representatives of participating local institutions in the villages of Aik Berik and Mumbul Sari in West Nusa Tenggara, and the village of Fatumnasi in East Nusa Tenggara. The Project Field Coordinator and four project technical consultants were also interviewed in Mataram City.

Initial findings were discussed with the EA after the preliminary evaluation report was presented during the exit conference held on 11 May 2015 in Jakarta. The Project Coordinator was requested to provide additional information needed to complete the analysis of the project's performance.

3. Project facts

ITTO PD 521/08 Rev. 3 (I) was implemented by the EA (which is under the Ministry of Forestry, Indonesia) in collaboration with the World Wide Fund For Nature, Nusa Tenggara Province (WWF), and the Forestry Service in Nusa Tenggara Province. Implementation started on 2 June 2011 and was completed on 31 August 2013, or a total project duration of 27 months.

The project addressed the problem on the very limited participation of forest-dependent communities living in the vicinities of Mount Rinjani and Mount Mutis in the sustainable utilization of NTFPs and the conservation of protected forests. The project specifically aimed to

- improve the capacity of forest-dependent communities to obtain permits to utilize the NTFPs in the protected forests; and
- develop an elaborated management plan for economically viable extraction of NTFPs through a community participatory process.

The total ITTO Contribution was USD 490,374. Of this amount, ITTO retained USD 71,324 for project monitoring and review, ex-post evaluation, and programme support costs. Upon completion and ITTO's approval of the project's audited final financial report, the EA returned an unspent amount of USD 18,645.60.

4. Findings and lessons learned

4.1 Project Achievements

The project team completed all planned activities with some deviations approved by the PSC. The project outputs are described as follows:

- Forest communities in North and Central Lombok successfully set up cooperatives and were able to acquire permits to utilize NTFPs from designated areas in protected forests. In terms of additional forest area managed sustainably by communities in Nusa Tenggara, the new permits cover an additional 3385 hectares, i.e. 1516 hectares in North Lombok, and 1869 hectares in Central Lombok.
- An elaborated management plan for the sustainable development of priority NTFPs was completed. The plan highlights the importance of building a shared vision and mission for NTFP management, formulating development direction, objectives and strategies for the community, the institutions and businesses. It includes a matrix of responsibilities of all key agencies involved in the sustainable utilization of NTFPs. Using the elaborated management plan as template, the project assisted the North Lombok and Central Lombok communities to draft management plans for their priority NTFPs.

A key project accomplishment was the conduct of a detailed study on the policy options that local governments can implement to support sustainable utilization of NTFPs. Within the project duration, the districts of North Lombok and Central Lombok were able to implement three (out of six) recommended policy options. The policies are:

- Establishment of a district NTFPs working group;
- Identification of priority NTFPs on a district level; and
- Implementation of guidelines for the sustainable utilization of NTFPs.

The priority NTFPs identified were honey, bamboo, candlenut, durian, sugar palm, jackfruit, areca nut, avocado, and various medicinal plants. With the assistance of the Provincial Extension Coordinating Agency, North and Central Lombok NTFP business groups successfully acquired all required product certifications, were issued business permits and registered with the Provincial Trade and Industry Service.

Forest farmers in Fatumnasi village (in East Nusa Tenggara) who participated in training courses organised by the project, successfully set up a community-based cooperative for the production of wild honey from sustainably managed forests. Their product has been successfully commercialised and is being distributed through various outlets in the province. So far the members have benefitted from income generated from their business venture, and are able to avail of loans from their cooperative for various needs such as for their children's education.

4.2 Project Formulation and Implementation

The problem addressed in this project was identified in 2008 through a series of discussions conducted by WWF Indonesia with forest community leaders, farmers, forestry service staff (provincial and district levels), university researchers, and other stakeholders in the West Nusa Tenggara province. WWF also held a series of meetings with the Ministry of Forestry-ITTO Clearing House.

The project strategy was appropriate. By improving the capacity of forest-dependent communities and the local governments, the project objective was achieved in the target communities within a 27-month period. However, more careful study of the project design, particularly the vertical logic of the project elements, would have resulted in more efficient pacing of activities and shorter timelines.

The project implementation involved 11 forest-dependent villages within the vicinities of Mt Rinjani and Mt Mutis. The Project Implementing Unit (PIU) was structured in such a way that the EA and the collaborating agencies were represented. Four academic staff from the University of Mataram served as

project consultants. Aside from the provincial and district Forestry Service units, members of the local parliament, District Planning Agency, Provincial Extension Coordinating Agency and the Provincial Trade and Industry Service participated in the project. Community leaders, farmers, heads and members of NTFP-based small businesses and industry groups took part in training courses and extension activities. Some activities were delayed and others took longer than planned due to unexpected project staff turnover and the change of leadership in some local governments. Also, the timing of project activities was sometimes not compatible with the target participants' priorities, such as during the harvest season.

Compared to the participating communities in Mt Rinjani, the forest-dependent communities in Mt Mutis adopted the project interventions at relatively slower pace. The approach taken by the project in enjoining indigenous communities to participate in project activities took into consideration the strong cultural traditions and beliefs that continue to influence upland people's attitudes on land use and forest practices.

The project was completed on a three months extension until August 2013. No additional funding support was requested by the EA, however the budget was realigned in May 2012 to enable the completion of field activities. The planned hiring of an international consultant was not pursued; instead a local consultant performed the required task. All project outputs were delivered within the total approved budget, with USD 18, 645.60 unspent and returned to ITTO.

The expected roles of key stakeholders and the terms of reference (TOR) for key project staff were defined in the project document. However, the TORs for the Project Coordinator and Field Coordinator, revisions to the structure of the Project Implementing Unit that were intended to address the Expert Panel's recommendations (39th meeting), and the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) between the EA and WWF are difficult to reconcile. Inconsistencies in some provisions of these documents may have contributed to problems brought up (during this evaluation) by the EA and the WWF regarding certain aspects of communication, financial and overall project management.

In a project monitoring and evaluation meeting, the Project Steering Committee (PSC) recommended more appropriate indicators, and for baseline data associated with the indicators to be determined at the project sites. A review of the project appraisal reports shows that the Experts Panel (37th and 38th meetings) had previously recommended such changes to the project logical framework matrix. However, the changes made were not done adequately. Clarification of this matter was made during the evaluation exit conference.

The EA complied with all technical and financial reporting requirements. Project acquittal was achieved on 28 January 2014 or five months after the actual project completion date and upon ITTO's approval of the project final audit report and the EA's plan of disposal of project capital items.

4.3 Lessons Learned

- The participatory approach used in the development of training modules, management plans, business models and policy options for the sustainable utilization of NTFPs, together with the project's technical assistance to local governments on the formulation of strategic policies on NTFP utilization were effective in achieving the desired outcomes within the project duration.
- The indigenous people's beliefs on the essential elements of life are generally aligned with the principles of sustainable forest management. Sustainable management of upland forests can be achieved by engaging indigenous communities using an approach that takes into consideration their cultural beliefs and traditional practices.
- The additional income derived by forest farmers from community-based enterprises drives their participation in sustainable forest management.
- The active participation of target communities and the relevance of studies implemented by project consultants contributed significantly to the success of the project.

- The established presence of the collaborating agencies in Nusa Tenggara was key to the willingness of forest farmers and local institutions to participate in the project.
- While the uncorrected logical framework matrix seemed not to have significant effect on the project at the outset, this evaluation found that the usefulness of the logical framework matrix is diminished when determining the project boundaries, tracking project progress and evaluating project performance.

5. Conclusions and Recommendations

5.1 Conclusions

The outputs and specific objective of ITTO PD 521/08 Rev. 3 (I) were completed within 27 months or 3 months longer than planned. The participation of target communities in sustainably utilizing NTFPs has been reasonably improved as a result of the (i) training courses on sustainable forest management, business skills and entrepreneurship, and awareness seminars on the environmental, social and economic benefits of protected areas; and (ii) the technical assistance provided to local communities in formulating an elaborated management plan for priority NTFPs.

The most important achievements of the project were the formulation and implementation of three local government policies to support sustainable utilization of NTFPs, and the expansion of protected forest area covered by sustainable forest management. These achievements support the Ministry of Forestry's NTFP Development Policy and Community Forest Regulation.

The achievement of the project objectives in the target communities is attributed largely to the active participation of stakeholders and the participatory approach used in the development of training modules, management plans, business models and policy options.

Timely translation of the policies into a regulatory framework at the provincial level and the incorporation of priority NTFPs identified in this project in the list of priority commodities under the Ministry of Forestry's Community Forest Regulation are envisioned to deliver wider impact and long-term sustainability of project impacts.

5.2 Recommendations

For the EA

1. Prioritise support for the realization of the three remaining recommended policy options to support sustainable utilization of NTFPs, i.e. (i) development of a local government policy on NTFPs partnership and trade regulation that will enable NTFP business groups to forge partnership with major industry players; (ii) translation of the administrative policies on NTFPs into a regulatory framework; and (iii) conduct of an executive review of the Ministry of Forestry's Community Forest Regulation (No. P.35/Menhut-II/2007) and amend the Annex on the priority commodities by adding the priority NTFPs identified in this project.
2. Support capacity building for indigenous communities, including identifying opportunities and developing strategies for sustainable forest management in upland areas, and the conduct of research on the traditional beliefs and forestry practices in forest-dependent communities.
3. In future projects with a similar objective, adopt this project's strategy however taking particular note of the insights on project design as pointed out in this evaluation.
4. In implementing future ITTO projects, the key implementing officer(s) should exercise due diligence in examining the consistency of the project document, agreements, TORs and other instrumentalities and bring up all issues with the EA, ITTO and the PSC in a timely manner.

For ITTO

1. On the project appraisal process, conduct more thorough evaluation of the project logical framework matrix presented in the project document, and the effectiveness of the work plan in the execution of the project as designed.

Part 2 Main Text

1. Introduction

1.1 Background and rationale of the evaluation

The Committee on Economics, Statistics and Markets and the Committee on Forest Industry (CEM-CFI), during their Forty-Eighth Session (November 2014) decided that an ex-post evaluation of ITTO PD 521/08 Rev. 3 (I) be conducted to establish how well the project served its purpose and draw recommendations for future action.

The ex-post evaluation was carried out on 4-11 May 2015 or approximately twenty-two months after project completion. This report provides an in-depth diagnosis of the project, presents its successful and unsuccessful outcomes, the reasons for successes and failures, the sustainability of its effects and contributions toward the achievement of ITTO Objective 2000¹, and recommendations that can improve similar projects in the future.

1.2 Project identification

Serial number: PD 521/08 Rev. 3 (I)

Title: Participatory Forest Management for Sustainable Utilization of Non-Timber Forest Products (NTFP) Surrounding the Protected Area of Rinjani and Mutis Mountains, Nusa Tenggara Indonesia

Host Government: Republic of Indonesia

1.3 Executing Agency and Collaborating Agencies

Executing Agency : Directorate General of Watershed and Social Forestry (EA) under the Ministry of Forestry, Indonesia

Collaborating Agencies : World Wide Fund For Nature, Nusa Tenggara Province, Indonesia (WWF) Forestry Service, Nusa Tenggara Province, Indonesia

1.4 ITTO context of the project

The objectives of the International Tropical Timber Agreement (ITTA) 2006 are to promote the expansion and diversification of international trade in tropical timber from sustainably managed and legally harvested forests, and to promote the sustainable management of tropical timber producing forests.

The ITTA 2006 sets out the Organization's longstanding aims of enhancing the capacity of members to export tropical timber from sustainably managed forests and to improve market transparency, forest-based enterprises and sustainable forest management. It also expands the scope of previous agreements to include objectives related to poverty alleviation, forest law enforcement, NTFPs and environmental services, voluntary market mechanisms such as certification, and the role of forest-dependent communities.

PD 521/08 Rev. 3 (I) is aligned with the ITTA 2006 objectives, specifically by:

(c) contributing to sustainable development and to poverty alleviation;

(q) promoting better understanding of the contribution of NTFPs and environmental services to the sustainable management of tropical forests with the aim of enhancing the capacity of members to

¹ In Decision 2 (XXIX), the Council reaffirmed its full commitment to moving as rapidly as possible towards achieving exports of tropical timber and timber products from sustainably managed sources. It labeled this commitment 'ITTO Objective 2000'.

develop strategies to strengthen such contributions in the context of sustainable forest management, and cooperating with relevant institutions and processes to this end; and
(r) encouraging members to recognize the role of forest-dependent indigenous and local communities in achieving sustainable forest management and develop strategies to enhance the capacity of these communities to sustainably manage tropical timber producing forests.

PD 521/08 Rev. 3 (I) is also aligned with the following specific actions and expected outcomes under the ITTO Action Plan 2008-2011:

Actions by the Committee on Forest Industry:

Expected outcome 1: Increased production and further processing of tropical timber and other forest products from sustainably managed and legally harvested sources.

- Enhance poverty alleviation and economic development through stronger support for small-scale and community-based forest enterprises.
- Initiate projects on small-scale or community based enterprises, including analyses of the social, policy and legal frameworks, market opportunities and barriers, and developmental aspects. Develop and implement comprehensive long-term strategies to support community-based forest enterprises
- Undertake pilot and demonstration projects based on the use of NTFPs harvested in tropical timber-producing forests and support the widespread uptake of these in parallel with timber production.

Actions by the Reforestation and Forest Management:

Expected outcome 5: Tropical forest resource better secured

- Identify opportunities for and implement activities to capitalize on NTFPs and environmental services that further the security of the tropical timber resource base, taking into account the needs of forest-dwelling indigenous and local communities
- Identify and implement innovative and socially sound interventions that contribute to poverty alleviation and improved livelihoods for forest dependent people while securing the tropical timber resource base

2. Evaluation scope, focus and approach

2.1 Purpose

This report provides an in-depth diagnosis of the project, identifying its successful and unsuccessful outcomes, the reasons for the successes and failures, the sustainability of the project's outcomes, and contribution towards the achievement of ITTA 2006 Objectives and ITTO Strategic Action Plan 2008-2011, and to draw lessons that can be used to improve similar projects in the future.

2.2 Terms of reference

- Assess the project's design and contribution to the achievement of the project objectives.
- Assess the achievement of the project's outputs and specific objectives.
- Evaluate the impact and relevance of the project, detailing its impact on development and specific objectives as stated in the project documents.
- Determine the effectiveness of technology transfer to target groups if applicable.
- Assess the overall post-project situation for the projects, including the conditions of their intended direct or indirect beneficiaries.
- Define and assess unexpected effects and impacts, either harmful or beneficial, and present the reasons for their occurrences.
- Analyze and assess implementation efficiency, including the technical, financial and managerial aspects.

- Assess the overall sustainability of the project after completion, and include appropriate recommendations to safeguard the continuity of its positive impacts, and enhance utilization of the technologies (if applicable) and other results developed by the project.
- Taking into account the results of the evaluation, make an overall assessment of the projects' relative success or failure, to summarize the key lessons learnt; and identify any issues or problems that should be taken into account in designing and implementing similar projects in future.
- Assess the overall cost of the projects with original budget provisions, and their respective linkage with the overall results.
- Prepare the evaluation report in accordance with the references for the Project Evaluation Report, as contained in the ITTO Manual for Project Monitoring, Review and Evaluation, third edition and the ITTO Manual on Standard Operating Procedures 2009.
- Assess the project's contribution to the relevant ITTA objectives (1994 and 2006) and the relevant ITTO Action Plan.
- Prepare one or more articles for each project, for possible publication in the ITTO Tropical Forest Update (TFU), in consultation with the editor, containing an overview of the projects and summarizing the lessons learned from the evaluation work. Appropriate photographs should be provided.

Appendix A shows the timelines for this evaluation as agreed upon by ITTO and the Consultant.

2.3 Approach

A review of the project design, logical framework matrix, planned and reported outputs, and intended outcomes was conducted using the following reference documents provided by ITTO:

- Project Document (project proposal)
- Completion Report
- Final Technical Reports
- Experts Panel Project Appraisal Reports
- Project Steering Committee (PSC) Meetings
- Yearly plan of operations
- Bi-annual progress reports
- Final independent financial audit report

Guide questions were formulated for key project staff and selected participants. The Project Coordinator, the EA representative, and Ministry of Forestry staff were briefed on the purpose and methodology of the ex-post evaluation during the opening meeting held in Jakarta on 4 May 2015.

From 5-9 May 2015, interviews were conducted with field staff and meetings held with participating community leaders and farmers, and representatives of participating local institutions in the villages of Aik Berik and Mumbul Sari in West Nusa Tenggara, and the village of Fatumnasi in East Nusa Tenggara. The Project Field Coordinator and four project technical consultants were also interviewed in Mataram City.

Initial findings were discussed with the EA after the preliminary evaluation report was presented during the exit conference held on 11 May 2015 in Jakarta. The Project Coordinator was requested to provide additional information needed to complete the analysis of the project's performance.

Appendix B outlines the Consultant's itinerary of travel to Indonesia, and Appendix C lists the participants of the evaluation.

3. Project facts

3.1 Background and origin

Nusa Tenggara is one of the least developed islands of Indonesia. Mount Rinjani in West Nusa Tenggara and Mount Mutis in East Nusa Tenggara are classified as protected areas. Both are important water catchment areas, with Mount Rinjani supplying water to the villages in Southern Lombok, and Mount Mutis, the villages in West Timor.

Communities in villages bordering the protected forests, especially those in the upstream areas, are some of the poorest in the region. People supplement their livelihood by gathering resources for their daily needs such as for food and firewood, and grazing their livestock in the forest. Through the years, their livelihood activities have gradually encroached into the protected areas. Unsustainable harvesting and grazing practices have caused soil erosion and loss of forest cover. It has reported that an estimated 30% loss in forest cover in these areas has caused significant watershed deterioration and decline in water supply to the villages by around 40% compared to some 20 years ago.

3.2 Development objective

The project aimed to promote the sustainable management of protected forests in Nusa Tenggara Island, Indonesia.

3.3 Problem addressed

The forest-dependent communities within the vicinities of Mount Rinjani and Mount Mutis have very limited participation in the sustainable utilization of NTFPs and the conservation of the protected forests.

3.4 Specific objectives and outputs

The project specifically aimed to improve the participation of local communities in promoting sustainable utilization of NTFPs by

- improving the capacity of forest communities to obtain permits for the utilization of NTFPs; and
- developing an elaborated management plan for economically viable extraction of NTFPs, through a community participatory process.

3.5 Rationale

In the forests of Mt Rinjani and Mt Mutis, there are at least 36 NTFPs that have the potential to be utilized sustainably by communities in the surrounding villages. These include fruits, wild honey, sugar palms, sandalwood, eaglewood, resin, rattan, bamboo, tamarind, candlenut, medicinal herbs and plants, coffee and cacao.

The Provincial Forestry Service grants Community Forest Utilization permits but only to community groups who have set up cooperatives, and are able to meet the required know how and management skills. However, majority of the communities do not meet these requirements. In Mt Rinjani for example, only 15 out of 80 communities had permits while in Mt Mutis, none of the communities had a permit². Furthermore, the local governments lack the capacity to formulate policies on sustainable utilization of NTFPs, and the District Forestry Service units responsible for managing the protected areas have low capacity to implement participatory management programmes for the communities.

3.6 Start date and project duration

This project commenced on 2 June 2011 and was completed on 31 August 2013, or a total project duration of 27 months.

3.7 ITTO Contribution

The total approved ITTO Contribution is USD 490,374 broken down as follows:

Government of Switzerland	USD 400,000
Government of Japan	45,187
Government of USA	45,187

Out of the total ITTO contribution, USD 71,324 was retained for project monitoring and review, ex-post evaluation, and programme support costs; and an unspent amount of USD 18,645.60 was returned by the EA to ITTO upon ITTO’s approval of the project’s audited final financial report.

² These numbers were cited in the project document prepared in 2008. Current figures are not available.

4. Findings and lessons learned

4.1 Project Achievements

(i) Planned vs. realised outputs

The project team completed all planned activities and two outputs, with some deviations approved by the PSC.

The preparation of training modules, business plans, management plans, and policy options that contributed to the completion of the two project outputs was largely participatory and focused on the target communities. Primary data and information were gathered through focus group discussions, consultative workshops, and structured interviews with farmers, small-business entrepreneurs, forest gatherers, community leaders, local parliament members, district and provincial officials, and other stakeholders in the target forest-dependent villages. Based on this information, four technical reports were prepared by the consultants as follows:

- Training module development to improve the capacity of local community groups for sustainable utilization of on timber forest products (Muktasam, May 2012)
- Management policy analysis study of NTFPs in the Provinces of West Nusa Tenggara and East Nusa Tenggara (Gatot Dwi Hendro, July 2012)
- Management Plan for Non Timber Forest Products in the Community Forest of Central and North Lombok, West Nusa Tenggara (Amiruddin Umar, August 2012)
- Dealing with NTFPs for income generation of local communities in pilot villages (Rinjani and Mutis) (Taslim Sjah, Oct 2012)

The outputs delivered by the project are as follows:

Output 1 – The target communities have gained improved capacity to obtain community forest utilization permits.

- Forty-three aspiring training facilitators covering 11 villages participated in the training course on participatory forest management composed of 11 training modules. These numbers exceed the targets, i.e. 20 training facilitators covering nine villages. The training sessions also provided participants with technical knowledge and skills on bamboo and honey production, processing and marketing.
- Pilot communities adopted three out of the six potential business models aimed at maximizing income from ten extractable and economically viable NTFPs in the pilot sites.
- Five stakeholders each in the Rinjani and Mutis areas participated in on-the-job training courses on small-scale business management and entrepreneurship.
- All participating forest-dependent communities attended awareness seminars on the environmental, social and economic benefits of protected forests.
- Participating communities in North Lombok, Central Lombok, and South Central Timor were able meet the Ministry of Forestry's Community Forest Regulation by successfully setting up the required community-based cooperatives.

Output 2 – An elaborated management plan for more economically viable NTFPs was prepared.

- An elaborated management plan for the sustainable development of ten priority NTFPs was completed as planned (See contents in Appendix D). The plan highlights the importance of building a shared vision and mission for NTFP management, formulating development direction, objectives and strategies for the community, the institutions and businesses. It includes a matrix showing the responsibilities of key agencies involved in the sustainable utilization of NTFPs. Using the elaborated management plan as a template, the project assisted the communities of North Lombok and Central Lombok to draft their own management plans for their priority NTFPs.

(ii) Outcomes

Community forest utilization permits forests issued to participating forest-base communities

- Forest communities in North and Central Lombok successfully set up cooperatives and were able to acquire permits to utilize NTFPs from designated areas in protected forests. In terms of additional forest area managed sustainably by communities, the new permits cover an additional 3385 hectares, i.e., 1516 hectares in North Lombok, and 1869 hectares in Central Lombok.

Target communities adopted the elaborated NTFPs Management as template for the preparation of draft district-wide NTFP management plan

- The North Lombok and Central Lombok community groups adopted the elaborated NTFPs management plan as a template for drafting a management plan for each district's priority NTFPs;

(iii) Impacts of project interventions

The reports prepared by the project consultants provided templates and references that the communities are able use in formulating their own management plans for the sustainable utilization of NTFPs. These were also useful to the local governments in formulating the policy guidelines for the sustainable utilization of NTFPs in their area, which meets a compliance requirement of the Ministry of Forestry's Community Forest Regulation.

The Districts of North Lombok and Central Lombok executed three out of six recommended policy options (Gatot 2012) within the project duration. The policies are:

- Establishing an NTFPs working group;
- Identification of priority NTFPs on a district level; and
- Guidelines for the sustainable utilization of NTFPs.

The three recommendations that are still to be realised are:

- The development of a district policy on NTFPs partnership and trade regulation;
- Translation of the administrative policies on NTFPs into a regulatory framework; and
- The amendment of the EA's Community Forest Regulation (No. P.35/Menhut-II/2007) in order to include the priority NTFPs identified in this project to the priority commodities covered by this regulation.

The details of the local government policies are as follows:

- In 2012, North Lombok government decree 382/126/DPPKK 2012 and Central Lombok government decree 469/2012 were issued to establish NTFP Working Groups in these districts. The decree states the responsibilities of each member in the preparation of strategic plans, policies and development programs on NTFPs at the district level. The decrees set out the composition and roles (Sponsor, Director, Coordinator, Chairperson, Secretary and 10 members), and expected deliverables that are to be reported to and monitored by local government. In December 2014, the district of South Central Timor issued a similar decree.
- The local governments of North and Central Lombok approved the NTFP management plans prepared by communities and adopted this as the District NTFP Master Plan. These plans underpinned the issuance of the local government policy guidelines for the sustainable utilization of NTFPs. The North Lombok decree number 17: Guidelines on Management of NTFPS was released on 1 July 2013, and the Central Lombok district decree number 20: Guidelines on Management of NTFPS was released on 24 July 2013. At the time of this evaluation, the District of South Central Timor was finalizing its NTFP management plan.

Legitimate business enterprises established and products commercialized

- With the assistance of the Provincial Extension Coordinating Agency, the North and Central Lombok NTFP business groups have successfully acquired all required product certifications, and have been issued business permits and registered with the Provincial Trade and Industry Service.
- Forest farmers in Fatumnasi village (in East Nusa Tenggara), who participated in training courses organised by the project, have set up a community-based cooperative for the production of wild honey from sustainably managed forests. Their produce has been successfully commercialised and is being distributed through various outlets in the province. So far the members have benefitted from income generated from the business venture, and are able to avail of loans from their cooperative for various needs such as for their children's education.

Improved quality of NTFP-based products

- The North Lombok Honey Production Network has put in place a quality assessment and control mechanism for their community-based enterprise;
- The Candlenut Business Group (Kelompok Usaha Bersama Kemiri) has set up a candlenut grading system and developed the corresponding pricing scheme, product labeling and packaging as part of their improved marketing strategy.

Other positive effects

- The project-developed training modules on sustainable management of NTFPs have been adopted by the National Training Center of Indonesia.
- Due to the local government decrees on sustainable utilization of NTFPs, national government funding support for NTFP proposals have increased. For example, university researchers have successfully been granted funds amounting to 50 M IDR to support their NTFP-related public service roles³.
- The Central Bank of Indonesia (Mataram City) has committed financial support for capacity building on candlenut processing, as well as for the purchase of processing equipment that will increase honey production with improved quality, and the development of other products (bees wax, honeycomb, etc.).
- The Northern and Central Lombok business plans for honey production and candlenut processing are being used as templates by other community groups in preparing their own NTFP business plans.
- Local government has allocated budget for setting up NTFP business learning centers, such as the honey production and processing demonstration site in Sukadana village, which is a joint undertaking of the University of Mataram and four farmers groups.

(iv) Sustainability

The following actions help ensure the sustainability of the project effects:

- the inclusion of NTFPs as a priority in the Five-Year Plan of the West Nusa Tenggara Province;
- the adoption of the project-prepared management plan by other local governments as a template for the preparation of management plans for priority NTFPs;
- the implementation of a local government decree for the identification of priority NTFPs; and for the establishment of NTFP working groups that will be responsible for formulating strategic plans and policies, and accountable for the development and implementation of NTFPs programs in the district.
- the issuance of local government decree on the operationalization of the policy guidelines on sustainable utilization of NTFPs.

³ In Indonesian universities, a tenured academic staff is required to provide public service in addition to their teaching and research functions. Acquiring funds for public service is the responsibility of the academic staff.

The translation of the current decree on “Guidelines on the sustainable management of NTFPs” into a regulatory framework at the provincial level is the next step that may help ensure long-term sustainability of the project effects.

The inclusion of priority NTFPs identified in this project to the list of priority commodities under the Ministry of Forestry’s Community Forest Regulation is envisioned to ensure a wider impact and long-term sustainability of project effects.

4.2 Project formulation and implementation

(i) Stakeholder participation

- The problem addressed in this project was identified in 2008 through a series of discussions conducted by WWF Indonesia with forest community leaders, farmers, forestry service staff (provincial and district levels), university researchers, and other stakeholders in the West Nusa Tenggara province. WWF also held a series of meetings with the Ministry of Forestry-ITTO Clearing House.
- The project was implemented in June 2011- August 2013, involving 11 forest-dependent villages within the vicinities of Mt Rinjani and Mt Mutis. The Project Implementing Unit (PIU) was structured in such a way that the EA and the collaborating agencies were represented. Four academic staff from the University of Mataram served as project consultants. Aside from the provincial and district Forestry Service units, members of the local parliament, District Planning Agency, Provincial Extension Coordinating Agency and the Provincial Trade and Industry Service participated in the project. Community leaders, farmers, heads and members of NTFP-based small businesses and industry groups took part in training courses and extension activities.

(ii) Project design and effectiveness

- The project strategy was appropriate. By improving the capacity of forest-dependent communities and the local governments, the project objective was achieved in the target communities within a 27-month period. However, more careful study of the project design, particularly the vertical logic of the project elements, would have resulted in more efficient pacing of activities and shorter timelines.
- The project was completed on a three months extension until August 2013. No additional funding support was requested by the EA, however the budget was realigned in May 2012 to enable the completion of field activities. The planned hiring of an international consultant was not pursued; instead a local consultant performed the required task. All project outputs were delivered within the total approved budget. At the end of the project, USD 18, 645.60 was unspent and returned to ITTO upon ITTO’s approval of the project’s audited final financial report.

(iii) Efficiency of operational aspects

- The expected roles of key stakeholders, and the terms of reference (TOR) for key project staff were defined in the project document. However, the TORs for the Project Coordinator and Field Coordinator, the revisions to the structure of the PIU that were intended to address the Expert Panel’s recommendations (39th meeting), and the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) between the EA and WWF are difficult to reconcile. Inconsistencies in some provisions of these documents may have contributed to the problems brought up (during this evaluation) by the EA and the WWF regarding certain aspects of communication, financial and overall project management.
- Some activities were delayed and some took longer than planned due to unexpected project staff turnover and the change of leadership in some local governments. Also, the timing of project activities was sometimes not compatible with the target participants’ livelihood activities, such as during the harvest season.
- Compared to the participating communities in Mt Rinjani, the forest-dependent communities in Mt Mutis adopted the project interventions at relatively slower pace. The approach taken by the

project in enjoining indigenous communities to participate in project activities took into consideration the strong cultural traditions and beliefs that continue to influence upland people's attitudes on land use and forest practices.

- In the villages of Fatumnasi and Nenas, for example, the Dawan⁴ people believe that people, their livestock and the forest they depend on are the essential elements of life; and if the wellbeing of any one of these elements is compromised, the wellbeing of the two other elements is compromised as well. Their tribal leaders decide on the community's laws and regulations, including access to the forest and its resources. This may explain why no permits to utilize NTFPs from the forests in this region has been issued so far. Nevertheless, the approach used by the project implementing unit in East Nusa Tenggara was effective in encouraging the target communities in this area to adopt project interventions, including participation in training courses that enabled them to establish a community-based cooperative that now runs their NTFP-based small business enterprise on wild honey production
- The EA complied with all technical and financial reporting requirements. Project acquittal was achieved on 28 January 2014 or five months after the actual project completion date and upon ITTO's approval of the project final audit report and the EA's plan of disposal of project capital items.

(iv) Project appraisal process

- The project document went through three Experts Panel appraisals (37th to 39th meetings). A review of the project document shows that the recommended changes to the project logical framework matrix were not done adequately. During the implementation phase, the PSC made recommendations along the same lines, i.e. more appropriate indicators and baseline data associated with the indicators should be determined at the project sites. Clarification of this matter was made during the evaluation exit conference.

4.3 Lessons Learned

- The participatory approach used in the development of training modules, management plans, business models and policy options for the sustainable utilization of NTFPs, together with the project's technical assistance to local governments on the formulation of strategic policies on NTFP utilization were effective in achieving the desired outcomes within the project duration.
- The indigenous people's beliefs on the essential elements of life are generally aligned with the principles of sustainable forest management. Sustainable management of upland forests can be achieved by engaging indigenous communities using an approach that takes into consideration their cultural beliefs and traditional practices.
- The additional income derived by forest farmers from community-based enterprises drives their participation in sustainable forest management.
- The active participation of target communities and the relevance of studies implemented by project consultants contributed significantly to the success of the project.
- The established presence of the collaborating agencies in Nusa Tenggara was key to the willingness of forest farmers and local institutions to participate in the project.
- While the uncorrected logical framework matrix seemed not to have significant effect on the project at the outset, this evaluation found that the usefulness of the logical framework matrix is diminished when determining the project boundaries, tracking project progress and evaluating project performance.

⁴ The Dawan are one of the earliest inhabitants of Timor and the largest group in western Timor, but were divided into numerous small kingdoms (Pasture)

5. Conclusions and recommendations

5.1 Conclusions

The outputs and specific objective of ITTO PD 521/08 Rev. 3 (I) were completed within 27 months or 3 months longer than planned. The participation of target communities in sustainably utilizing NTFPs has been reasonably improved as a result of the (i) training courses on sustainable forest management, business skills and entrepreneurship, and awareness seminars on the environmental, social and economic benefits of protected areas; and (ii) the technical assistance provided to local communities in formulating an elaborated management plan for priority NTFPs.

The most important achievements of the project were the formulation and operationalization of three local governments policies to support sustainable utilization of NTFPs, and the expansion of protected forest area covered by sustainable forest management. These achievements support the Ministry of Forestry's NTFP Development Policy and Community Forest Regulation.

The achievement of the project objectives in the target communities is attributed largely to the active participation of stakeholders and the participatory approach used in the development of training modules, management plans, business models and policy options.

Timely translation of the policies into a regulatory framework at the provincial level and the incorporation of priority NTFPS identified in this project in the list of priority commodities under the Ministry of Forestry's Community Forest Regulation are envisioned to deliver wider impact and long-term sustainability of project impacts.

5.2 Recommendations

For the EA

1. Prioritise support for the realization of the three remaining recommended policy options to support sustainable utilization of NTFPs, i.e. (i) development of a local government policy on NTFPs partnership and trade regulation that will enable NTFP business groups to forge partnership with major industry players; (ii) translation of the administrative policies on NTFPs into a regulatory framework; and (iii) conduct of an executive review of the Ministry of Forestry's Community Forest Regulation (No. P.35/Menhut-II/2007) and amend the Annex on the priority commodities by adding the priority NTFPs identified in this project.
2. Support capacity building for indigenous communities, including identifying opportunities and developing strategies for sustainable forest management in upland areas, and the conduct of relevant research on the traditional beliefs and forestry practices in forest-dependent communities.
3. In future projects with a similar objective, adopt this project's strategy however taking particular note of the insights on project design as pointed out in this evaluation.
4. In implementing future ITTO projects, the key implementing officer(s) should exercise due diligence in examining the consistency of the project document, agreements, TORs and other instrumentalities and bring up issues with the EA, ITTO and the PSC in a timely manner.

For ITTO

1. On the project appraisal process, conduct more thorough evaluation of the project logical framework matrix presented in the project document, and the effectiveness of the work plan in the execution of the project as designed.

Appendix A ITTO - Consultant agreed timelines

March 2015	Dispatch of the following documents supporting for the evaluation work: <ul style="list-style-type: none">(i) Relevant ITTO Manuals(ii) Project documents(iii) Technical reports(iv) Project audit reports and(v) Project completion reports
April/May 2015	Meeting with the EA in Indonesia for briefing and comprehensive discussions and analysis of project implementation and results, as well as preparing the work programme for field visits. Discussions with relevant stakeholders involved in the projects works.
August 2015	Submission of draft evaluation report (Executive Summary) to ITTO, the EA and the governments of Indonesia for comments and suggestions
September 2015	Submission of the full final report including executive summary, and power point presentation to ITTO
October 2015	Submission of article(s) for possible publication in the TFU
November 2015	Presentation of the report during the 49 th Session of ITTO's permanent Committees on Forest Industry and Economic Information and Market Intelligence (CFI-CEM)

Appendix B Schedule of ex-post evaluation field activities in Indonesia

Date	Activity
03 May 2015 (Sunday)	1830 Arrival of the Consultant in Jakarta
04 May 2015 (Monday)	1000 – 1400 Meeting with EA, representative the Project national coordinator, and other Ministry of Forestry staff
05 May 2015 (Tuesday)	0550-0855 Air travel to Lombok, West Nusa Tenggara
	0900-1030 Travel by car to Aik Berik Village, Central Lombok (near Mt. Rinjani forest reserve area) 1100 – 1400 Meeting with community representatives of Aik Berik and surrounding villages who participated in the community forestry program, the local government NTFPs (NTFP) working group, and local government officers 14:30-16:30 Travel by car to Mataram 17:00 – 19:00 Meeting with four Project Consultants at Mataram Santika Hotel meeting room 1900 -2000 Meeting with project field coordinator
06 May 2015 (Wednesday)	0730 -0930 Travel to Mumbul Sari, North Lombok – one of the project sites 1000 -1400 Meeting with representatives from Mumbul Sari and surrounding villages of the Santong area who participated in the community forestry program, the local government NTFP working group, and local government officers 14:30 -15:30 Visit to Non Timber Forest Products (Honey) Demonstration project in Sukadana village – joint project the local government and the University of Mataram
07 May 2013 (Thursday)	0730 Travel by car to Lombok airport 0930 -1300 Air travel to Kupang (East Nusa Tenggara) airport via Denpasar 1300- 1400 Travel to Kupang 1400-1800 Travel by car to Soe City, Timor Tengah Selatan 1900 -2000 Meeting with Forestry Officer and Member of local government NTFP working group
08 May 2013 (Friday)	0800-1000 Travel by 4WD utility vehicle to Fatumnasi village, Mutis 1000- 1500 Meeting with representatives Fatumnasi village who participated in the community forestry program, the local government NTFP working group, and local government officers 1300 – 2000 Travel back to Kupang
09 May 2013 (Saturday)	0430 Travel to Kupang airport 0600-1045 Air travel to Jakarta 1300 - 2000 Field data review
10 May 2013 (Sunday)	Whole day - report writing
11 May 2013 (Monday)	1000- 1300 Closing meeting with EA representative, project, national coordinator and other Ministry of Forestry staff
12 May 2013 (Tuesday)	Travel back to Perth, Western Australia

Appendix C List of evaluation participants

1. Ex-Post Evaluation Opening Meeting, 4 May 2015, Ministry of Forestry, Jakarta

Name	POSITION
Ery Indrawan (Rep of the EA)	Deputy Director of Social Forestry Products of Directorate Social Forestry Dev.
Sahala Simanjuntak	Formal National Project Coordinator/ Section Head of Bilateral and Regional Centre for International Cooperation
Aries Kurniawan	Section Head, Evaluation Programme of DG.WMSFD
Nining NP	Deputy Director of Centre for International Cooperation
Niniek Irawan	Deputy Director of Community Forestry of Directorate Social Forestry Dev.
Syaful Anwar	Deputy Director of Institutional. DG.WMSFD
Murdoko	Deputy Director of Law and International Technical Cooperation, DG.WMSFD
Arief Setyo	Head of Section of International Technical Cooperation of DG.WMSFD)
Irfan Cahyadi	Head of Section of Technical Cooperation. Centre for International Cooperation
Harry Sulis.	Deputy Director of NTFP of DG Forest Product Development
Wawan Kurniawan	Staff of Centre for International Cooperation
Tb Ajie R	Staff of Directorate Social Forestry Development
Eko H Kuncoro	Deputy Director Programme and Budgeting of DG.WMSFD
Hardono	Staff of DG.WMSFD

2. Meeting with Project Participants, 5 May 2015, Village of Aik Berik, Central Lombok, East Nusa Tenggara

Name	Position/Office represented
Syafrudin Syafti	Project Technical Officer
SQ Niftan	Member, NTFP Working Group Kelompok Masyarakat, Aik Berik
Afian Eko Pernomo	Watershed Management Agency, Ministry of Forestry
L Erwandi	FMKR, Lantan
M Amrillah	APBL, Praya
Ihwan	APBL Promotion and Marketing
Mulyanto	BTNGR, Mataram
L Sanhwin S	BTNGR, Selong
L Arsyad	BTNGR, SPTN II Lotim
L Supardi	BTNGR, SPTN II Lotim
L Pardihan M	BTNGR, Mataram
Silwasdi	Dishut NTB, Mataram
Riskal	Dishut NTB, Mataram
Ganawardana	Bappada Lotey, Praya
Marwi	FMKR, Aik Berik
Alhilal	Diskoperindag, Praya
Kurniawan	WWF
Rusdiono	FMKR, BKU
Amini	FMKR, BKU
Komang Ayu Triayani	Project Finance Officer
Baig Zulfa Pijoyanti	WWF

3. Meeting with Project Participants, 5 May 2015, Village of Mumbul Sari, North Lombok, East Nusa Tenggara

Name	Position/Office represented
Syafrudin Syafti	Project Technical Officer
Soni Sanjaya	DPPK/Bidhut, Kabal-Gondang
Kadis	Penguluh Kehutan, Gondang
Purnia	Asmalora
Joko M	Perinfag, Gangga
Samsudin	KUB Madu, Bayan
Sabarian	KUB, Bayan
Saripudin	Asmalora, Bayan
Afian Eko Pernomo	BPDAS AMS, Mataram
Wahyu	DPPKKS, Gondang
I Nyoman Jana	Peuyuluh Keluitanan, Janying
I GD, Aqus Mastika	TNGR, Anyar
Handianto	TNGR, Anyar
Ida Mada Kanten	TNGR, Anyar
Jumada	Asmalora, Dusun Salut Timor
Lukman Hakim	Asmalora, Bensek
Muzakar	BPDAS, Mataram
Baiq Zulfa Pijayanti	WWF Mataram
Arya Ahsani Takulim	WWF Mataram

4. Meeting with Project Consultants, 6 May 2015, Mataram Hotel Santika, West Nusa Tenggara

Name	Position/Office represented
Syafrudin Syafti	Project Technical Officer
Gatot DH Wibowo	FH-UNRAM, Mataram
Amiruddin	UNRAM, Mataram
Taslim Sjah	FP- UNRAM, Mataram
Muktasam	University of Mataram
Rioha Hakim	WWF staff
Komang Ayu Triyani	Project Finance Officer
Baiq Zulfa Pajanyanti	WWF staff

5. Meeting with Forest Community, 8 May 2015, Fatumnasi, Mutis , East Nusa Tenggara

Name	Position/Office represented
Syafrudin Syafti	Project Technical Officer
Christian Koenunu	Dishut TTS - Forestry Service Nusa Tenggara Province
Novestis Jefu	JMM
Matias Naitboho	JMM
Amos Oematun	JMM
Simsun Muang	JMM
Obet Kase	JMM
Semuel Tabatab	JMM
S Agung Sri R	BPK Litbang Kupang
Yeni Fredik Nomeni	Project Technical Officer

6. Ex-Post Evaluation Closing Meeting, 11 May 2015, Ministry of Forestry, Jakarta

Name	Position/Office represented
Ery Indrawan (Rep of the EA)	Deputy Director of Social Forestry Products of Directorate Social Forestry Dev.
Sahala Simanjuntak	Formal National Project Coordinator/ Section Head of Bilateral and Regional Centre for International Cooperation
Aries Kurniawan	Section Head, Evaluation Programme of DG.WMSFD
Nining NP	Deputy Director of Centre for International Cooperation
Niniek Irawan	Deputy Director of Community Forestry of Directorate Social Forestry Dev.
Syaful Anwar	Deputy Director of Institutional. DG.WMSFD
Murdoko	Deputy Director of Law and International Technical Cooperation, DG.WMSFD
Arief Setyo	Section Head, International Technical Cooperation of DG.WMSFD)
Irfan Cahyadi	Section Head, Technical Cooperation. Centre for International Cooperation
Harry Sulis	Deputy Director of NTFP of DG Forest Product Development
Wawan Kurniawan	Staff of Centre for International Cooperation
Tb Ajie R	Staff of Directorate Social Forestry Development
Eko H Kuncoro	Deputy Director Programme and Budgeting for DG WMSFD
Hardono	Staff of DG WMSFD

CHAPTER I INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 Background
- 1.2 Definitions and Term Limits
- 1.3 Aims and Objectives
- 1.4 Target Users
- 1.5 Scope and Linkage between the Management Plan of NTFPs with Other Planning Documents
- 1.6 NTFP Management Planning Process

CHAPTER II REGIONAL OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH

- 2.1 Conditions of Geography, Natural Resources and Environment
- 2.2 Conditions of Population and Human Resources
- 2.3 Economy Conditions

CHAPTER III EXISTING CONDITION OF FOREST RESOURCES MANAGEMENT

- 3.1 Extent and Potential of Forest Resources
- 3.2 The Development and Condition of Community Forest Management (HKm)
- 3.3 Condition of Non-Forest Timber Products (NTFPs) Management

CHAPTER IV VISION, MISSION AND OBJECTIVES OF NTFP MANAGEMENT

- 4.1 Vision
- 4.2 Mission
- 4.3 Objectives

CHAPTER V DIRECTION, GOALS AND STRATEGY FOR NTFP DEVELOPMENT

- 5.1 Area Management
 - Direction 1. Development of Data and Information on Potential NTFP plants
 - Direction 2. Development of Cultivation Technologies for NTFPs
 - Direction 3. Development of Farmers/Communities Capacity for NTFPs on Aspects of Farming and Area Management
- 5.2 Institutional Management
 - Direction 1. Institutional/Organizational Community and Government Development
 - Direction 2. NTFPs Information Systems Development
 - Direction 3. Research and Technology Development
 - Direction 4. Development of Social Work (*Net Working*) Stakeholders NTFPs
 - Direction 5. Development of Regulation and or Policy Supports for NTFP Management
- 5.3 Business Management
 - Direction 1. NTFPs Manufacturing Development
 - Direction 2. Capital for Enterprise NTFPs Development
 - Direction 3. Marketing and Promotion of NTFPs Development

CHAPTER VI NTFP DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMS AND ACTIVITIES

- 6.1 Area Management
- 6.2 Institutional Management
- 6.3 Business Management

CHAPTER VII MONITORING AND EVALUATION

- 7.1 Monitoring and Evaluation Mechanisms
- 7.2 Actors and Time for Monitoring and Evaluation
- 7.3 Monitoring and Evaluation Instruments
- 7.4 Recommendations and Feedback
- 7.5 Monitoring and Evaluation Report

CHAPTER VIII CLOSING

REFERENCES

APPENDIX

Management Response to ITTO Ex-Post Evaluation	
<p>Project Title: Participatory Forest Management for Sustainable Utilization of Non-Timber Forest Products Surrounding the Protected Area of Rinjani and Mutis Mountains, Nusa Tenggara Province, Indonesia</p> <p>Project ID: ITTO PD 521/08 Rev. 3 (I)</p>	
A) Overall Response to the Evaluation:	
<p><i>(Please insert your overall views on the evaluation report, e.g. structure, methodology and its conclusions)</i></p> <p>This evaluation report has good structure and methodology. The recommendations are also very helpful to review policy in developing NTFPs as important commodities for communities to increase their welfare and to support sustainable forest management.</p>	
Evaluation Report Recommendations*	B) Response to recommendations <i>(e.g. 'accept', 'partially accept' or 'reject' – please provide a brief explanation)</i>
<p>Recommendation 1</p> <p>Prioritise support for the realization of the three remaining recommended policy options to support sustainable utilization of NTFPs, i.e.</p> <p>(i) development of a local government policy on NTFPs partnership and trade regulation that will enable NTFP business groups to forge partnership with major industry players;</p> <p>(ii) translation of the administrative policies on NTFPs into a regulatory framework; and</p> <p>(iii) conduct of an executive review of the Ministry of Forestry's Community Forest Regulation (No. P.35/Menhut-II/2007) and amend the Annex on the priority commodities by adding the priority NTFPs identified in this project.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - (i) accept - (ii) accept - (iii) partially accept: to amend the Annex of the MoF Forest Regulation needs a long process including getting an agreement from many stakeholders, hence this NTFPs can be declared as priority commodities in local government regulation regarding NTFPs. Beside that, the recommendation should also mention the NTFPs identified in this project.
<p>Recommendation 2</p> <p>Support capacity building for indigenous communities, including identifying opportunities and developing strategies for sustainable forest management in upland areas, and the conduct of research on the traditional beliefs and forestry practices in forest-dependent communities.</p>	<p>Accept</p>
<p>Recommendation 3</p> <p>In future projects with a similar objective, adopt this project's strategy however taking particular note of the insights on project design as pointed out in this evaluation.</p>	<p>Accept</p>

<p>Recommendation 4</p> <p>In implementing future ITTO projects, the key implementing officer(s) should exercise due diligence in examining the consistency of the project document, agreements, TORs and other instrumentalities and bring up issues with the EA, ITTO and the PSC in a timely manner.</p>	<p>Accept</p>
--	---------------

Name, Title and Institution of Respondent:

Dudi Iskandar, SE, M.Hum.

Head of Division of Law and Technical Cooperation

Secretariat Directorate General of Watershed Controlling and Protected Forest

Ministry of Environment and Forestry

Date, Signature:

28 August 2015

